

**MINUTES OF THE 180th MEETING OF THE MUNICIPAL CORPORATION
CHANDIGARH HELD ON 28.05.2012 AT 11.00 A.M. IN THE ASSEMBLY HALL OF
THE CORPORATION CHANDIGARH.**

The followings were present:-

- | | |
|---------------------------------|-------------------|
| 1. Smt. Raj Bala Malik | Mayor |
| 2. Sh. Pawan Kumar Bansal, M.P. | Ex-Officio Member |
| 3. Sh. V.P. Singh, IAS | Commissioner |
| 4. Sh. Darshan Kumar | Sr. Dy. Mayor |
| 5. Sh. Satish Kumar | Deputy Mayor |
| 6. Sh. Babu Lal, IAS (Retd.) | Councillor |
| 7. Sh. Anoop Sunny Gill | Councillor |
| 8. Dr. Shagufta Parveen | Councillor |
| 9. Maj.(Retd.) D.S. Sandhu | Councillor |
| 10. Sh. M.P. Kohli | Councillor |
| 11. Sh. Sat Paul Bansal | Councillor |
| 12. Smt. Sheela Devi | Councillor |
| 13. Sh. Surinder Bahga | Councillor |
| 14. Sh. Saurabh Joshi | Councillor |
| 15. Smt. Asha Kumari Jaswal | Councillor |
| 16. Sh. Subhash Chawla | Councillor |
| 17. Sh. Sat Parkash Aggarwal | Councillor |
| 18. Sh. Arun Sood | Councillor |
| 19. Smt. Gurbax Rawat | Councillor |
| 20. Sh. Malkiat Singh | Councillor |
| 21. Smt. Harjinder Kaur | Councillor |
| 22. Sh. Harphool Chander Kalyan | Councillor |

23. Sh. Rajesh Kumar Gupta	Councillor
24. Sh. Mukesh Bassi	Councillor
25. Sh. Satinder Singh	Councillor
26. Sh. Naresh Kumar	Councillor
27. Smt. Jannat Jahan Ul Haq. (Naina)	Councillor
28. Smt. Heera Negi	Councillor
29. Sh. Davesh Moudgil	Councillor
30. Smt. Rajinder Kaur	Councillor
31. Sh. Gurcharan Das	Councillor
32. Sh. Des Raj Gupta	Councillor
33. Sh. Rajiv Kumar Gupta, PCS	Secretary

The following Officers also attended the meeting: -

1. Sh. Sunil Bhatia, PCS	Additional Commissioner-I
2. Sh. Lalit Siwach, HCS	Additional Commissioner-II
3. Sh Mukesh Anand	S.E.(B&R)
4. Sh R.C. Diwan	S.E.(PH)
5. Dr. B.K. Salwan	M.O.H.
6. Sh. Desh Raj	C.A.O.
7. Sh Yogesh Gupta	XEN (Roads-I)
8. Sh Jai Pal Singh	XEN (Roads-II)
9. Sh Harinder Singh	XEN (P.H. Div No-I)
10. Sh R.S. Ahluwalia	XEN (P.H. Div No-II)
11. Sh Anil Bansal	XEN (P.H. Div No-III)
12. Sh Gurpreet Singh	XEN (P.H. Div No-IV)
13. Sh Surinder Pal Singh	XEN (Electrical)

At the outset, the Secretary welcomed the Mayor, Hon'ble Minister of Parliamentary Affairs & Water Resources, Govt. of India-cum-ex-officio member, Commissioner, all the members of the House, Media persons and all the persons present in the House.

The Secretary announced that one of the Councillor Smt. Laxmi Devi had expired recently, therefore, he requested all the members to observe silence for two minutes.

“The House observed silence for two minutes”.

Sh. Davesh Moudgil said that many people were present in the cremation of Smt. Laxmi Devi including Mayor, Councillors & many officers of the Corporation. He further said that the House of the Corporation is considered highest democratic set up in the city and the Councillors are elected representative of the city. He proposed that in the event of death of a sitting councilor, his/her cremation should be done with full honours. He further said that three sitting councilors namely Sh. Gurnam Singh, Sh. Arshad Khan & Smt. Laxmi Devi expired in the recent past but no officer of the Chandigarh Administration was present there. It is a custom to lay down a wreath on behalf of the authorities on the death of a person, but there is no such practice for the Councillors of Municipal Corporation. He suggested that a Committee be constituted to decide the protocol system on the death of Councillors.

The Commissioner said that the sentiments of the House will be conveyed to the Chandigarh Administration as the matter of protocol lie in the domain of the Chandigarh Administration.

Agenda Item No.1**Confirmation of the minutes of 179th meeting of the General House held on 30.4.2012 at 11.00 a.m. in the Assembly Hall of the M.C. Chandigarh.**

The Secretary placed agenda item No.1 before the House for confirmation.

Major D.S.Sandhu said that it has come to know through the newspaper that the Chief Engineer would visit various sectors to see the development of the projects. He requested that the nominated councilors should also be involved in the visit of the Chief Engineer, so that they could also contribute for the development works.

Smt. Harjinder Kaur pointed out that at page 13 of the minutes, she had specifically inquired about the reasons about re-tendering the matter of laying of pipelines of MES, when the tenders were received and all the formalities were complete, but this issue has not been mentioned.

Sh. Davesh Moudgil pointed out that while discussing the matter of Housing Societies he had mentioned about non-availability of Mandir, Gurudwara, shopping centre and food street in sector-48 & 49, but it has not been recorded.

Sh. Saurabh Joshi pointed out that at page 12, line 14th the word “work for three reaches” should be substituted as “work for four reaches. He further said that he had spoken at length in the last meeting about the MS pipes project but the members are very short.”

Sh. Malkiat Singh pointed out that at page 4 of the minutes, the following lines should be added after para 5 :-

“Sh. Malkiat Singh said that Sh. Sat Parkash Aggarwal did not inform him.”

“Sh. Arun Sood said that all the Councillors are equal and therefore Sh. Malkiat Singh should also have been informed.”

Sh. Malkiat Singh further said that while discussing agenda item No.2, he had also opposed the agenda and made some statement which is not recorded in the minutes.

Sh. Arun Sood said that while discussing agenda item No.2, he had also stated that the letter pertaining to this matter was received in the office in the year 2010, but this matter was not brought before the House deliberately as the elections were due. Since the elections have been over, therefore, this matter has been placed before the House. He desired that his statement should also be added in the minutes. He further said that the minutes be prepared within a week after the meeting so that minutes could be recorded accurately.

Sh. M.P. Kohli stated that various Committees have not been finalized even after lapse of five months, then how the development works could be completed within time. He said that the fire fighting equipments of the Corporation are not working, similarly, the lift is not in working order, neither there is any ramp, but no action is being taken on these issues. He further said that a Councillor does not make a mistake if he bring some facts to the knowledge of the House but the Councillor who raised some issues regarding laying pipelines for MES was not included in the Committee constituted to inquire into the matter. He requested that such petty matters should be resolved amicably.

The Commissioner stated that most of the Councillors desire that their statements should be recorded in the minutes in detail, which takes time. However, if only summary of minutes is to be prepared, then it could be done within next two three days. He further said that word to word recording is not possible in short period.

Sh. Saurabh Joshi said that in Parliament word to word minutes are recorded. He further said that if the minutes are not recorded in detail, then the citizen of the city would not know as to what issue was raised by the Councillors.

The Commissioner clarified that there are some limitations while preparing the minutes and word to word minutes are difficult to be recorded. However, there is no deliberate reason to conceal the statements of the Councillors. He proposed that the video cassette could be supplied to any member, if the member so desires.

Sh. Arun Sood agreed that the video C.D. of the meeting may be supplied to the members alongwith minutes.

“The House confirmed the minutes of 179th meeting of the General House held on 30.04.2012 at 11.00 a.m. in the Assembly Hall of the Municipal Corporation, Chandigarh, with the afore-mentioned amendments.”

Sh. Davesh Moudgil welcomed Sh. Rajiv Kumar Gupta, PCS, new Secretary of the Corporation and also thanked the outgoing Secretary for his contribution.

Sh. Malkiat Singh asked why Sh. Saurabh Joshi was issued a letter to appear before the Committee, as an accused.

Sh. Satinder Singh read out the letter issued to Sh. Saurabh Joshi and said that raising an issue in the House is not an offence. He enquired whether the letter was issued by the S.E. (P.H.) at his own level or on the instructions of someone else. He further said that the contents of the letter are derogatory.

Smt. Harjinder Kaur said that Sh. Saurabh Joshi made a lot of hard work on the issue of laying pipes for MES, despite that many technicalities are involved in this issue, but he

was not included in the Committee constituted to inquire into the matter. Moreover, he was issued a letter to appear before the Committee. She had suggested to adopt the CPWD Manual in toto and to delegate the powers at lower level so that the system could be improved.

Sh. Arun Sood said that at the time of formation of committees the members of the opposition party were ignored and in protest they submitted their resignations. He appreciated the efforts of Sh. M.P. Kohli, Sh. Sat Paul Bansal and other nominated councilors to normalize the situation and to sort out the matter amicably. But now Sh. Saurabh Joshi was ignored while constituting a committee to enquire into the matter despite the fact that he had studied the matter deeply and did hard work. Similarly, he himself raised the issue of uniform and Smt. Harjinder Kaur raised the issue of CPWD Manual and Sh. Davesh Moudgil brought an agenda but they were ignored while constituting the committee on these issues. He asked whether the members of the opposition party are not able to be convener of these committees. He further asked whether the Secretary of the said committee issued the letter at his own or on the direction of someone else. He further said that Sh. Subhash Chawla was nominated as Chairman of the said committee but he resigned from the said committee. He enquired the reason for this.

Sh. Subhash Chawla said that he had no role for not including Sh. Saurabh Joshi as member of the committee as the House had authorized the Mayor to constitute the committee. So far as the letter is concerned it was issued with his consent. Since Sh. Saurabh Joshi had sufficient knowledge in this matter, therefore, it was felt that he should be associated in the inquiry into the matter. He further said that Sh. Saurabh Joshi was also respectable member of the House and there was no malafide intention in issuing the letter. There is no derogatory word in the letter neither there was such intention as he has been requested to appear before the

committee whereas an accused is directed. However, he tenders apology in case this letter appears derogatory to any member. He further said that there are some personal reasons because of which he cannot continue as Chairman of the committee.

Sh. Arun Sood said that keeping Sh. Saurabh Joshi out of the committee indicates that there is something wrong and is being concealed. He demanded that vigilance enquiry be got conducted in the matter. He said that the Mayor being head of the city should not be biased. He further pointed out that the condition of the city has worsened as there are number of dog bite cases, stray cattle, drinking water etc.

The Mayor said that if the members consider that the Committee has not been constituted properly, then it may be dissolved.

“The House by majority resolved that the Committee constituted to inquire into the matter relating to laying of M.S. Pipes for MES be dissolved and the inquiry be got conducted through Vigilance.”

Agenda Item No.2

1. Question by Major D.S. Sandhu (Retd.)

Major D.S. Sandhu (Retd.) read out his question and said that 10% posts in ‘C’ and 20% in ‘D’ category are reserved for ex-servicemen as per instructions of Government of India. He said that the reply given by the office is sketchy and it has been observed that the office has not recruited ex-servicemen during the last 15 years. He requested to implement the instructions of Govt. of India while filling up the vacant posts in the Corporation.

Smt. Harjinder Kaur said that Brig.K.S.Chandpuri (Retd.) a highly decorated person has been raising this issue for the last five years, but nothing has been done.

The Commissioner stated that the policy of Government of India is followed in the Chandigarh Administration according to which 10% posts in Group 'C' and 20% in Group 'D' are reserved for ex-servicemen. Whenever, recruitment is made, reservation for ex-servicemen is also made, but in case eligible ex-serviceman is not available, the post is filled up out of the general category. The local Sainik Welfare Officer is invited in the recruitment committee to check the observance of rules. He assured that in future the interest of the ex-servicemen will be watched. However, the already laid down rules can not be amended by the House.

Major D.S.Sandhu (Retd.) said that on job training should be imparted to the ex-servicemen if they do not fulfill the requisite qualification for the post.

2. Question by Sh. Arun Sood, Councillor

Sh. Arun Sood said that he had sent an agenda on 21.5.2012 for Wi Fi connectivity, and video conferencing facility in the Assembly Hall & Committee Room. He further said that a projector be installed in the Assembly Hall so that the Councillors could explain their points easily and in short period. He further said that modern technology should be utilized and pointed out that the official website has not been updated, neither reply is sent on face book page. He further said that the agenda of the House should also be uploaded on the website immediately, so that public could also see it.

The Commissioner stated that the said agenda was received in the office only recently and action is being taken on it. There are many things which can be taken up by the office at its own as all the issues are not required to be brought before the House for approval. He assured that action would be taken on it and if required it would be placed before the House.

Taking up the question, Sh. Arun Sood thanked the Commissioner for supplying the reply of the question. He said that he has not received the reply of most of his questions. He was also surprised to see the lengthy reply. He repeated his questions regarding number of parking passes issued. He particularly enquired about how many additional parking passes were issued by the Mayor and under which rules, provisions etc. and how many passes were issued to Sr. Deputy Mayor and Deputy Mayor, but the officers have not replied to these questions properly. He further stated that passes issued are totally illegal resulting in financial loss to the Corporation.

The Additional Commissioner-I replied that office has supplied all the information as per available record and nothing has been concealed.

Sh. Subhash Chawla asked, who was responsible for non-availability of record in the office and further said that such type of question have been raised due to the lapse of the office.

The Additional Commissioner again clarified that the record for the period 2006 to 2011 is not available, however office has enclosed/supplied the required information in the annexures.

Sh. Subhash Chawla stated that concerned officer supplied the information for the particular period to defame the Mayor and some Councillors. He further stated that the record since the year 2002 may be scrutinized to see facts/truth in the matter. He further clarified that it was just to defame the Councillors to mention that some passes were issued in excess.

There was din in the House so nothing could be recorded.

The House adjourned for tea at 12.20 p.m. and reassembled at 12.40 p.m.

Sh. Pawan Kumar Bansal stated that the matter regarding issue of excess parking pass has been raised and he suggested that passes given to other persons except the media/press who covers the Corporation may be withdrawn.

Sh. Arun Sood again repeated his question and stated that first of all the office should have thoroughly understood the question and then the decision will be taken afterwards. He further stated that office has not replied that how many stickers were issued to the Mayor, Sr. Deputy Mayor and Deputy Mayor since 2005 and further clarified that he has no objection if the information be placed before the House since 2002 and if the record is not available the responsibility be fixed accordingly. He further enquired that whether the Holograms were also printed through the same printer or otherwise. In reply to his question, the office has informed that total 3020 passes were printed whereas the printer supplied the bill for printing of 3039 stickers, out of 3020 passes 773 are for two wheeler and 2247 for four wheeler. He further clarified that one car pass costs Rs.300/- per month, which is valid for 36 months, so total value of one car pass is Rs.10,800/- each and the total cost of these stickers will be Rs.2,84,41,800/-.

There was again din in the House so nothing could be recorded.

Maj. D.S. Sandhu (Retd.) stated that all of us should maintain decorum of the House. So all of us should not use un-parliamentary language in the House.

Smt. Harjinder Kaur pointed out that she was never been issued more than two-three passes. She has been in the House for the last 16 years.

Sh. Arun Sood stated that the office has informed him that Councillors are entitled for 5 passes only and there is no resolution of the House in which it was decided that Mayor, Sr. Dy. Mayor and Dy. Mayor are entitled for more passes than their admissibility, whereas the Mayor has issued 406 passes out of which 222 passes were out of Councillor's quota, 35 passes from employee's quota, 131 passes from Ex-Councillor's quota and 18 passes out of sample printed by the office against admissibility of 5 passes only. He further informed the House the value of these 406 stickers issued by the Mayor costs Rs.43,84,800/- as passes are valid for 3 years.

There was again din in the House so nothing could be recorded.

Sh. Arun Sood stated that as per information supplied by the office 406 passes have been issued by the Mayor and 11 passes issued by the Sr. Dy. Mayor and 11 by the Dy. Mayor and office has issued 8 passes to Sh. Subhash Chawla which includes 5 passes from Councillor quota and 3 from Ex-Councillor quota, whereas a Councillor is entitled for only 5 passes. He further stated that more than 5 passes were issued to the Councillors. It is mandatory in the rules that applicant first mention his/her vehicle number, whereas the office has not mentioned any vehicle number against the passes issued to the Councillors. He further stated that as per his knowledge and information the diaries and telephone directory are being printed from the Printing & Stationery Department, U.T., Chandigarh, whereas the parking stickers were printed from some private printer and the Hologram printed on the sticker is also printed by the same private printer and there is no parameter to ascertain that how many Holograms were printed by him. He further referred to an incident of Sector 37 market, wherein a person who was on maruti car entered the paid parking slot with a sticker of Councillor. On enquiry he told that he belonged to a particular political party. He further stated that office printed 400 passes of

Councillors against the 35 existing Councillors. It shows our irresponsible behaviour and it affects our dignity and also waste crore of rupees of public money. He further said that the printer has not submitted complete bills, whereas he is printing the passes as well as the Holograms. It seems that he is earning income from some other sources by selling the passes. He asked why these passes were being printed from a private party, whereas the diary of the office is being printed from the Security Press. He asked the Mayor, to whom 406 passes were distributed, whereas the Councillors were entitled only for five passes. He also asked to fix the responsibility for printing the passes from private printer. He said that the public money amounting to crore of rupees has been wasted for which responsibility be fixed.

Sh. Subhash Chawla said that the process of issuing passes was started in the year 2002 when a Councillor was stopped by the security guard. Then it was decided to issue stickers to the Councillors. When the paid parking was started it was decided in the House to issue free parking stickers to the Councillors against submissions of copy of RC. Then two passes were also issued to the Media persons, who were covering the Municipal Corporation. Then from time to time the members of the House demanded to issue the free parking stickers to the handicapped persons, gallantry award winners, employees of the Corporation and Judges of the High Court. No Councillor objected while the resolutions were passed by the House. He suggested that House should deliberate for improving the faulty system instead of politicizing the issue. He further pointed out that this year 3039 parking passes were printed, whereas 3556 passes were printed in the year 2007 and the cost of these passes comes to Rs.3.00 crore.

Smt. Harjinder Kaur said that enquiry be conducted in the matter and responsibility be fixed and recovery be got done.

The Mayor suggested that all the passes issued so far should be treated as cancelled.

At this there was uproar in the House.

Sh. Arun Sood said that the number of passes printed is not the main issue but the main matter is that how many passes were got issued by the Mayor, Sr.Dy. Mayor & Dy. Mayor etc. So far as, Smt. Harjinder Kaur is concerned, she had got issued only two passes whereas she is entitled for five passes. He challenged that not even a single pass was got issued in excess during the tenure of Smt. Harjinder Kaur as Mayor. He inquired as to who was the printer from whom the stickers are being printed. He further said that a big scam is involved in this matter and the public money involved should be deposited with the Corporation.

Sh. Satinder Singh said that the entitlement for free parking passes has been decided by the House which is mentioned at page 74 of the reply, which he read out. He said that passes have been issued to the blood donors without mentioning their specific number issued by the blood bank society. Similarly, passes have been issued to the handicapped persons and 570 passes have been issued to the media persons. He said that public money should not be wasted in such a manner and an inquiry be got conducted in the matter.

Sh. Subhash Chawla seconded the views of Sh. Satinder Singh that inquiry be conducted whether the passes have been issued to the right persons. He admitted that the printer is his relative who has been printing the stickers since he was not a Councillor. However, he took responsibility that if the said printer has printed the stickers more than ordered by the officers, then he should be penalized 10 time more than the provisions. He further said that if any person related to him and to any Councillor, Officer & Media Persons do business with the

Corporation, then he should be disqualified immediately and this condition should be applicable to all.

Sh. Arun Sood reiterated that 406 passes were distributed without entitlement for which responsibility should be fixed and the money wasted in this processes should be recovered. The previous Mayor who utilized the petrol more than entitlement had deposited the money with the Corporation. Similarly, the Mayor should also deposit the money for issuing 401 passes in excess or submit the resignation.

At this many Councillors started speaking together loudly.

The House adjourned for lunch at 1.45 p.m. and reassembled at 2.40 p.m.

Sh. Sat Pal Bansal said that the lot of time of the House has been wasted since last 5 months. However, the points raised by Sh. Arun Sood are genuine and the rules have been violated. He further said that the rules makers should not be rule breakers. He requested the members of the House that this issue should not be discussed any further. He proposed that all the free passes issued so far be treated as cancelled and a letter should be circulated to all the contractors of paid parkings that no free parking pass should be valid for free parking. A committee should be constituted consisting of members from all sections and new rules for this purpose should be laid down with the strict instructions that the rules should be followed in toto. A provision of penalty should also be laid for violations of rules.

Smt. Jannat Jahan Ul Haq seconded the proposal forwarded by Sh. Sat Pal Bansal and said that all the passes should be treated as cancelled.

Sh. Subhash Chawla said that the proposal given by Sh. Sat Pal Bansal is very good and proposed that the House should pass it.

*“The House by majority resolved that all the free parking passes issued so far be treated as cancelled.
The House further resolved that any further decision in the matter would be taken by the Finance & Contract Committee.”*

The members of the opposition party did not agree with this proposal.

Sh. Naresh Kumar requested the Mayor to inform the House the names of the persons to whom the passes were issued.

Many Councillors started speaking loudly together.

The members of the opposition party came to the well and started raising slogans against the Mayor.

The House adjourned for tea break at 3.15 p.m and reassembled at 3.50 p.m.

The members of the opposition party again started speaking loudly and came into the well.

Amidst unruly scenes the Mayor adjourned the House.

**Secretary,
Municipal Corporation,
Chandigarh.**

**Mayor,
Municipal Corporation,
Chandigarh.**

Agenda Item No.3

Rough cost estimate for providing and laying 25mm thick SDBC on V-6 road in Sector 38-C, Chandigarh.

The Secretary placed agenda item No.3 before the House for approval.

“The House considered & unanimously resolved that the estimate amounting to Rs.35.17 lac for P/L 25mm thick SDBC on V-6 road in Sector 38-C, Chandigarh, be and is hereby approved.”

Agenda Item No.4

Rough cost estimate for providing and laying 25mm thick SDBC on V-6 road in Sector 24-D, Chandigarh.

The Secretary placed agenda item No.4 before the House for approval.

“The House considered & unanimously resolved that the estimate amounting to Rs.40.86 lac for P/L 25mm thick SDBC on V-6 road in Sector 24-D, Chandigarh, be and is hereby approved.”

Agenda Item No.5

Construction of 5MGD (22.7 MLD) sewage treatment plant and main pumping station (Phase-I) based pm SBR technology and all other works contingent thereto along with operation and maintenance for a period of 120 months after successful completion of trial run for a period of minimum 180 days.

The Secretary placed agenda item No.5 before the House for approval.

“The House considered & unanimously resolved that the estimate amounting to Rs.__ lac for Construction of 5MGD (22.7 MLD) sewage treatment plant and main pumping station

(Phase-I) based pm SBR technology and all other works contingent thereto along with operation and maintenance for a period of 120 months after successful completion of trial run for a period of minimum 180 days, be and is hereby approved.”

Agenda Item No.6

Rough cost estimate for construction of toe wall around the various parks and re-fixing of M.S flat railing on toe wall in Maloya Colony, Chandigarh.

The Secretary placed agenda item No.6 before the House for approval.

“The House considered & unanimously resolved that the estimate amounting to Rs.46.85 lac for construction of toe wall around the various parks and re-fixing of M.S flat railing on toe wall in Maloya Colony, Chandigarh, be and is hereby approved.”

Agenda Item No.7

Menace of stray dogs.

The Secretary placed agenda item No.2 before the House for consideration.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

**Secretary,
Municipal Corporation,
Chandigarh.**

**Mayor,
Municipal Corporation,
Chandigarh.**